



Norges
Handikapforbund

Evaluation Report of CBID Programme in Zambia and Zanzibar: Key Insights and Recommendations

BASIL KANDYOMUNDA

AUGUST 2024

Introduction

The evaluation aimed to assess the effectiveness of the Norwegian Association of Disabled (NAD) supported Community-Based Inclusive Development (CBID) Programme in Zambia and Zanzibar from 2020 to 2023 as implemented by NAD country office in Zambia and Madrasa Early Childhood Programme in Zanzibar. It involved evaluating CBID trainings, coordination mechanisms, and networking efforts. The evaluation's specific objectives were to : assess the quality and impact of trainings, the function and impact of information networks, compare delivery of interventions in CBID and non- CBID districts and to explore the institutionalisation of CBID in national teaching institutions. Ultimately the evaluation served to inform, identification of key success factors and to provide recommendations for the future development of the CBID supported by NAD.

Methodology

The evaluation used a Utilisation-Focused Evaluation (UFE) approach, prioritizing practical application and stakeholder involvement. Data were collected through document reviews, key informant interviews, community discussions, and online surveys. Data collection tools were meticulously crafted to meet the Terms of Reference (ToR) and support rigorous analysis. Stakeholder engagement was integral to the process, enhancing the evaluation's credibility and ensuring that findings would effectively inform programme improvements.

Findings

Effectiveness of CBID training

How effective is volunteer training in identifying and referring Persons with Disabilities of all ages?

Volunteer training in Zambia and Zanzibar has proven effective in identifying and referring persons with disabilities of all ages, though the approaches and outcomes vary. In Zambia, the training has equipped volunteers with essential knowledge and skills to identify and refer individuals with diverse disabilities, including mental disabilities. Notwithstanding these achievements, inadequate foundational awareness among some volunteers, limited resources, cultural stigmas, and coordination issues persists. In Zanzibar, the training has significantly improved identification and referral processes through enhanced community awareness, better-trained volunteers, and the establishment of local disability committees thereby leading to greater inclusion and support for persons with disabilities.

However, its impact has been somewhat constrained by limited coverage across districts. Overall, both contexts highlight the effectiveness of targeted training while underscoring the need for continued improvements in resources, awareness, and coordination.

To what extent are trainees prepared to offer community-level support?

The CBID training in Zanzibar effectively prepared trainees by offering comprehensive coverage of disability rights, inclusive education, and practical skills through interactive methods and culturally relevant content. Its strong emphasis on theoretical knowledge, practical application, and active engagement equipped participants to address the needs of people with disabilities in their communities effectively. In contrast, while trainees in Zambia gained general awareness about disability, they lacked sufficient hands-on skills, received inadequate support and resources. These hindered their ability to provide effective community-level support.

How institutionalised is CBID volunteer training?

The institutionalisation of CBID volunteer training in both Zambia and Zanzibar has made significant strides in embedding inclusive practices within community and governance frameworks. In Zambia, efforts to integrate CBID training into relevant institutional frameworks, provide consistent funding, align with disability policies, and build trainer capacity have fostered sustainability and effectiveness. This process has raised awareness, improved inclusiveness, and underscored the need for structured programmes. Conversely, Zanzibar's approach has involved aligning training with national policies, coordinating across ministries, and enhancing community-level support, albeit has faced challenges such as insufficient funding and resource limitations.

What are the results of training at national and district levels?

The CBID training at national and district levels in both Zambia and Zanzibar has yielded substantial positive results. In Zambia, the training has significantly increased awareness about disability rights, enhanced stakeholder engagement, and improved coordination among actors, leading to greater advocacy and participation by Persons with Disabilities. Similarly, in Zanzibar, the training strengthened the capacity of national and district stakeholders, improved policy advocacy, and enhanced community-level support, resulting in better access to services and more inclusive community participation. Challenges such as inconsistent application and limited resources persist.

How well-prepared are trainees for disability-inclusive planning and budgeting?

In Zanzibar, trainees at all levels demonstrate increased competence in advocating for and implementing inclusive policies. Similarly, in Zambia, trainees show strong knowledge and skills in disability management and stakeholder engagement, with a positive attitude toward inclusive planning. Despite these advancements, both regions face challenges in applying training consistently and securing necessary resources.

CBID Information Networks

CBID network elements and their effectiveness

The CBID networks in Zanzibar and Zambia are multifaceted collaborative frameworks aimed at advancing disability inclusion. In Zanzibar, the network includes government entities, local authorities, NGOs, Organisations of People with Disabilities (OPDs), community organisations, and training institutions, all working together to implement and advocate for inclusive policies and practices. **The CBID WhatsApp groups play a critical role in facilitating real-time communication and coordination. They have proven effective, with 78% in Zanzibar and 96% in Zambia of survey respondents rating them as effective, reflecting improved community awareness, better access to services, and significant policy and infrastructure advancements.** In Zambia, the networks involve government bodies, Non-governmental Organisations (NGOs), Civil Society Organisations (CSOs), Community Based Organisations (CBOs), and international partners, focusing on policy development, capacity building, and direct support. WhatsApp platforms and occasional face-to-face meetings enhance collaboration and accountability. Both networks demonstrate strong effectiveness in promoting disability inclusion through enhanced coordination, policy influence, and community engagement.

CBID stakeholder analysis

Notable progress has been made by both countries to utilise network participation to promote disability inclusion. However, despite **supporting systemic change, the networks lack oversight, funding, and inconsistent policy enforcement. There is need for additional capacity building to enhance stakeholder collaboration, ensure equitable resource distribution, and strengthen monitoring.**

Assess stakeholders' understanding of disability inclusion roles.

In both countries stakeholders' understanding of disability inclusion roles reflect a shared commitment to promoting equal rights and opportunities for persons with disabilities, albeit with varying focuses and approaches. In Zambia, government agencies are seen as policy and resource facilitators, NGOs and CSOs act as advocates and service providers, OPDs focus on representation and rights advocacy, community leaders drive grassroots engagement, educational institutions work on inclusive education, and employers strive for accessible workplaces. In Zanzibar, the National Council for People with Disabilities (NCPD) leads in policy coordination and advocacy, municipal councils and district authorities handle implementation and planning, CBID volunteers and local leaders facilitate community-level support, educational institutions adapt curricula for inclusivity, and NGOs and CSOs engage in advocacy and support. Overall, stakeholders across both countries **demonstrate collaborative effort in enhancing disability inclusion**

Have NGOs and CSOs changed their understanding and practice of disability inclusion?

NGOs and CSOs have shifted from a charity-based approach to a rights-based framework, focusing on empowering and actively involving persons with disabilities in all aspects of community life. The transition has led to improved accessibility and inclusivity in their projects, such as ensuring accessible training venues and providing necessary accommodations. Additionally, CBID has strengthened collaboration among various stakeholders, resulting in more coordinated advocacy efforts and enhanced public space accessibility. Overall, the CBID Programme has driven a more inclusive and rights-oriented approach within NGOs and CSOs, effectively addressing the needs of persons with disabilities.

What is the impact of the CBID matrix overview tool?

The tool has had a profound impact on disability inclusion in both Zambia and Zanzibar by providing a structured framework that integrates various stakeholders and sectors. It has facilitated enhanced disability-inclusive practices across health, education, livelihood, social, and empowerment domains by improving accessibility, promoting inclusive education, advancing affirmative employment actions, and advocating for better infrastructure and community attitudes. **The matrix has also clarified roles for stakeholders, improved coordination, and fostered community involvement in planning, leading to more tailored and effective interventions.** Further, it has supported the creation of digital networks for better

communication and facilitated participatory monitoring and evaluation, ensuring that disability issues are addressed comprehensively and sustainably.

What impacts do CBID networks have on the community level?

Overall, CBID networks have contributed to more inclusive and equitable communities by addressing disability-related challenges and improving systemic support.

In Zambia and Zanzibar, these networks have enhanced capacity for implementing inclusive initiatives, facilitated the mobilisation of resources, and strengthened collaboration among stakeholders, leading **to improved visibility and support for Persons with Disabilities. They have enabled better coordination, information sharing, and resource mobilisation, led to heightened government awareness, inclusive policies, and improved infrastructure.** Digital platforms have streamlined communication, and training programmes and equipped educators with skills to support students with disabilities. However, challenges such as limited funding and infrastructure persist.

Role of CBID Networks in Raising Awareness, Accessing Public Financing, and Influencing Government Planning

CBID networks have played a pivotal role in raising awareness, accessing public financing, and influencing government planning and budgeting to promote disability inclusion and ensure that Persons with Disabilities receive necessary resources and support. In both countries, the networks enhance understanding of disability issues through advocacy campaigns, community events, and information sharing, empowering Persons with Disabilities to assert their rights. They facilitate access to public financing by connecting OPD members and parent support groups with educational, healthcare, and livelihood resources, and advocate for dedicated budget allocations for disability inclusion. Additionally, CBID networks influence government planning by engaging with policymakers, participating in planning sessions, and pushing for legislative changes, such as the inclusion of disability considerations in national budgets and development plans.

To what extent have CBID networks facilitated systemic change and policy influence?

The advocacy role of CBID networks has led to concrete policy changes, such as the development of inclusive education laws and improved healthcare guidelines, directly benefiting Persons with Disabilities. The collaborative approach has fostered a more inclusive environment, increased community participation, and reduced

stigma, demonstrating the networks' pivotal role in driving comprehensive and systemic improvements in disability inclusion.

Have media practices changed due to participation in CBID networks?

Participation in CBID networks has significantly transformed media practices in both countries. In Zambia, the networks have driven a shift towards more inclusive and rights-focused media coverage, increasing visibility and promoting accurate portrayals of Persons with Disabilities. In Zanzibar, there was a specific training organised for the media personnel, which significantly influenced the frequency of media coverage of the disability issues. Currently, **media outlets, feature diverse perspectives more frequently, and employ inclusive language, and human-centred reporting focusing on personal stories of individuals with disabilities.** These changes have fostered more authentic representations, improved public awareness, and influenced policy advocacy. Overall, CBID networks have made significant strides in creating a more inclusive media landscape.

EQ15: Evaluate the sustainability of district and provincial network structures and their potential for CBID mainstreaming.

The sustainability of district and provincial network structures for CBID in Zambia and Zanzibar demonstrates promising potential. In Zambia, these networks benefit from strong stakeholder buy-in, continuous capacity-building, sustainable funding mechanisms, and policy advocacy. Likewise in Zanzibar, the integration of local stakeholders, government support, and community engagement **underpins a robust foundation for sustainability, though challenges such as financial scarcity, capacity constraints, and the gap between policy and practice need addressing.**

CBID Effectiveness and Impact

CBID initiatives in Zambia and Zanzibar have significantly advanced disability inclusion, albeit with varying results. In Zambia, active CBID programmes, like in Chongwe, have led to policy advancements, improved infrastructure, and better service delivery compared to non-CBID districts like Chilanga, which face fragmented services and weaker advocacy. Similarly, in Zanzibar, CBID efforts have integrated disability inclusion into broader development frameworks, enhancing access to education and healthcare. Non-CBID regions still struggle with less formalised support and limited access to inclusive services. These experiences underscore the importance of structured CBID approaches for effective and inclusive outcomes.

CBID Coordination structures

CBID coordination structures are essential for advancing disability inclusion. In both countries, the structures **have significantly advanced disability inclusion**. Zambia's framework includes the Ministry of Community Development and Social Services (MCDSS), Zambia Agency for Persons with Disabilities (ZAPD), and local CBID Coordinating Committees. These bodies focus on policy, registration, and programme implementation but struggle with incomplete institutionalization and funding issues. In Zanzibar, through the National Council for Persons with Disabilities (NCPD) a multi-tiered system involving national ministries, local committees, and grassroots organisations manages CBID efforts. Despite significant progress, Zanzibar faces challenges with consistent policy enforcement and data collection.

Disability Management Information System

The Disability Management Information System (DMIS) in Zambia serves as a crucial tool for managing and utilising data related to Persons with Disabilities in support of CBID initiatives. It is designed to facilitate comprehensive data collection, secure storage, and integration with other social protection systems like the Zambia Integrated Social Protection Information System (ZISPIS). Key features include detailed data collection on demographics, disabilities, socio-economic status, and access to essential services. This diverse data aids effective resource allocation and evidence-based policy development. However, challenges such as system complexity, inconsistent data input, and technical issues, particularly in rural areas, have impacted its effectiveness. Lessons learned from the Zambian DMIS can inform the development of similar systems in Zanzibar and other countries in the following ways.

- **Prioritising usability and accessibility is essential:** Systems should be designed with user-friendly interfaces and clear language to ensure ease of use for all stakeholders.
- **Investing in training and capacity building** is crucial for effective system utilisation, improving data accuracy, and system functionality.
- Engaging stakeholders throughout the system's development and implementation can address usability issues and foster ownership.
- Maintaining high data quality and consistency through established protocols and monitoring is vital for informed decision-making.
- Implementing continuous improvement practices through regular assessments and feedback can enhance the system's effectiveness and adaptability.

By incorporating these lessons, Zanzibar or any other country interested in establishing a CBID DMIS can develop a more effective and user-centric DMIS, thereby promoting better inclusion and service delivery.

Institutionalisation of CBID in National Teaching Institutions

In Zambia, the integration of CBID into university curricula—such as at the University of Zambia, Copperbelt University, and Monze Community Development Staff College—demonstrates effective practices and offers valuable lessons for promoting more effective and inclusive development initiatives. Key lessons include: the importance of a) designing user-friendly and accessible curricula and investing in comprehensive training and capacity-building, b) engaging stakeholders during curriculum development, c) emphasising and broadening community-based practical training, to include various vulnerabilities, and d) developing robust systems for tracking graduates and gathering feedback.

Lessons learnt

The evaluation of CBID in Zambia and Zanzibar highlights several key lessons for enhancing disability inclusion programmes.

1. **Training Depth and Resource Allocation:** Enhancing CBID training programmes in both Zambia and Zanzibar significantly builds stakeholder capacities and improves volunteer skills in identifying and advocating for disabilities. Increased training depth, resource allocation, and addressing cultural barriers are crucial to strengthening the programmes' effectiveness in these countries.
2. **Network Effectiveness:** CBID networks play crucial roles in promoting disability inclusion. The sustainability of disability inclusion in Zambia relies on stakeholder collaboration and comprehensive capacity-building initiatives. Disability inclusion in Zanzibar could be further enhanced with sufficient resources and well-defined structures.
3. **Impact and Effectiveness:** CBID as a strategy promotes advocacy, capacity building, and policy influence (Zambia) in addition to raising awareness on disability issues and making infrastructure more accessible to people with disabilities (Zanzibar). Improved collaboration and monitoring in Zambia, coupled with strategic high-level support in Zanzibar, could enhance national engagement and further the rights of persons with disabilities. Strengthened partnerships, better monitoring, and expanded CBID coverage are crucial across both countries to realise these goals..

4. **Coordination Mechanisms:** Effective CBID coordination mechanisms contribute to policy implementation and resource mobilization. Enhancing resource allocation, monitoring systems, and enforcement can improve policy implementation and resource mobilisation.
5. **Curriculum Integration:** Integrating CBID into curricula of higher education institutions in Zambia has demonstrated the value of incorporating inclusive education and practical training. Zanzibar can benefit from similar approaches by ensuring that educational institutions provide hands-on experience and address diverse vulnerabilities beyond disability.
6. **Human Rights and Planning:** Zanzibar's experience reflects a disconnect between project-focused approaches and broader CBID frameworks. Improved integration of human rights advocacy and inclusive education into CBID initiatives could improve on the status quo. Additionally, strategic government planning and alignment with national priorities are crucial for effective implementation.

- Strengthen collaboration and communication among government, NGOs, CBOs, and Persons with Disabilities, and create platforms for their engagement in decision-making.
 - Finalise guidelines for institutionalising coordination structures and secure sustainable financing.
5. Improve DMIS Utility:
 - Redesign the DMIS interface to be more user-friendly and provide comprehensive training and ongoing support for stakeholders.
 - Engage stakeholders in DMIS design and development and establish feedback mechanisms to enhance system accuracy and ownership.
 6. Institutionalise CBID in Higher Education:
 - Advocate for accessible infrastructure in higher education institutions and conduct tailored awareness campaigns for employers on disability inclusion.
 - Integrate community-based practical training into curricula to bridge theory and practice, using CBID focus districts for hands-on experience.

Recommendations

For Zambia:

1. Enhance CBID Trainings:
 - Develop advanced modules and specialised sessions for volunteers on diverse disabilities and referral processes, incorporating practical community-based rehabilitation training.
 - Implement robust monitoring and evaluation for volunteer training, using regular assessments and feedback to refine and improve the programme.
2. Strengthen CBID Information Networks:
 - Expand CBID networks to cover all 116 districts in Zambia for broader impact and leverage them for collaboration and advocacy.
 - Increase resources and improve coordination among stakeholders to support grassroots CBID activities.
3. Improve CBID Effectiveness and Impact:
 - Enhance collaboration among government agencies, NGOs, CBOs, and community leaders, and create platforms for knowledge sharing and best practices.
 - Invest in targeted capacity-building initiatives and develop robust monitoring and evaluation mechanisms with clear indicators.
 - Establish at least one CBID focus district per province for learning and replication.
4. Enhance CBID Coordination Structures:

For Zanzibar:

1. **Expand Training Reach:** Increase the geographical scope of CBID training to cover more districts and shehias. Invest in ongoing mentorship and support.
2. **Strengthen Networks:** Clearly define and communicate CBID network structures, overcome resource constraints through partnerships, and enhance resource mobilisation. Establish regular forums for network members.
3. **Enhance Programme Effectiveness:** Secure consistent high-level support, increase national-level engagement, and develop a comprehensive monitoring and evaluation framework.
4. **Clarify Theory of Change:** Ensure all projects align with the CBID Theory of Change and facilitate regular stakeholder meetings for better alignment and collaboration.
5. **Improve Strategic Planning:** Involve the national Steering Committee in annual planning and priority-setting and strengthen communication for better coordination with government initiatives.